

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE**

Open Society Justice Initiative v. Central Intelligence Agency et al
Assigned to: Judge Paul A. Engelmayer
Related Case: 1:19-cv-01329-PAE
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 01/09/2019
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff**Open Society Justice Initiative**

represented by **Amrit Singh**
Open Society Justice Initiative
224 W. 57th St
New York, NY 10019
212-548-0660
Fax: 212-548-4662
Email: amrit.singh@opensocietyfoundations.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David James Sandler
433 Classon Ave
Brooklyn, NY 11238
202-412-8413
Email: sandlerd@gmail.com
TERMINATED: 06/21/2019

Matthew Forbes
Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)
919 Third Avenue, 3rd Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212)-909-6886
Email: mforbes@debevoise.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Catherine M. Amirfar
Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)
919 Third Avenue, 3rd Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212)-909-6398
Fax: (212)-909-6836
Email: cimirfar@debevoise.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant**Central Intelligence Agency**

represented by **David Stuart Jones**
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86 Chambers St.)
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
212-637-2200
Fax: 212-637-2686
Email: david.jones6@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Natasha Waglow Teleanu
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY
86 Chambers Street, 3rd fl.

New York, NY 10007
212-637-2528
Fax: 212-637-2786
Email: natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter Max Aronoff
United States Attorney's Office for the
SDNY
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
212-637-2697
Fax: 212-637-2686
Email: peter.aronoff@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Department of Defense

represented by **David Stuart Jones**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Natasha Waglow Teleanu
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter Max Aronoff
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

National Security Agency

represented by **David Stuart Jones**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Natasha Waglow Teleanu
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter Max Aronoff
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**Office of the Director of National
Intelligence**

represented by **David Stuart Jones**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Natasha Waglow Teleanu
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter Max Aronoff
(See above for address)

**LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Defendant

Department of Justice

Defendant

Department of State

represented by **Peter Max Aronoff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
01/09/2019	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-16163411) Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Plaintiffs FOIA requests)(Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>3</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Central Intelligence Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>4</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Department of Defense, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>5</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to National Security Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>6</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Office of the Director of National Intelligence, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>7</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Identifying Other Affiliate Open Society Institute for Open Society Justice Initiative. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative.(Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/10/2019		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge John G. Koeltl. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php . (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019		Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php . (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019		Case Designated ECF. (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney Catherine M. Amirfar to RE–FILE Document No. <u>3</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>4</u> Request for

		<p>Issuance of Summons, <u>5</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>6</u> Request for Issuance of Summons. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the name of the party for whom the summons is being requested must be the first name that appears in the 'To' field on the summons request PDF; any name that follows the name of the party to be served must include 'c/o', 'via', or 'attn'; party name in the 'To' field must exactly match party name as it appears on pleading caption. Re-file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)</p>
01/10/2019	<u>8</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Central Intelligence Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>9</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Department of Defense, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>10</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to National Security Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>11</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Office of the Director of National Intelligence, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>12</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Amrit Singh on behalf of Open Society Justice Initiative. (Singh, Amrit) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>13</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Central Intelligence Agency. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>14</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Department of Defense. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>15</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to National Security Agency. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>16</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/16/2019		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Judge John G. Koeltl is no longer assigned to the case. (bcu) (Entered: 01/16/2019)
01/18/2019	<u>17</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>tolling answer deadline until 30 days from first business day following Justice Department funding restoration</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from David S. Jones dated January 18, 2019. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit standing order staying certain civil cases affected by lapse in appropriations)(Jones, David) (Entered: 01/18/2019)
01/18/2019	<u>18</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Amrit Singh on behalf of Open Society Justice Initiative. New Address: Open Society Justice Initiative, 224 W. 57th St, New York, New York, 10019, 2125480660. (Singh, Amrit) (Entered: 01/18/2019)
01/18/2019	<u>19</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Central Intelligence Agency served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019; Department of Defense served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019; National Security Agency served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019; Office of the Director of National Intelligence served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019. Service was accepted by Lisa Ahearn, Civil Clerk Supervisor. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/18/2019)
01/22/2019	<u>20</u>	ORDER granting <u>17</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 1/22/2019) (js) Modified on 7/1/2019 (js). (Entered: 01/22/2019)

02/14/2019	<u>21</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Natasha Waglow Teleanu on behalf of Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 02/14/2019)
02/22/2019	<u>22</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Consolidate Cases 19-cv-1329 and this action given identical FOIA requests addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 2/22/2019., CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re: <u>1</u> Complaint, to set a uniform answer date of March 18, 2019 for all defendants addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 2/22/2019. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence.(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 02/22/2019)
02/27/2019	<u>23</u>	ORDER granting (22) Letter Motion to Consolidate Cases; granting (22) Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer in case 1:19-cv-00234-PAE. Granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 2/27/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE (anc) Modified on 2/27/2019 (anc). (Entered: 02/27/2019)
02/27/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Central Intelligence Agency answer due 3/18/2019; Department of Defense answer due 3/18/2019; Department of Justice answer due 3/18/2019; Department of State answer due 3/18/2019; National Security Agency answer due 3/18/2019; Office of the Director of National Intelligence answer due 3/18/2019. (anc) (Entered: 02/27/2019)
03/18/2019	<u>24</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 03/18/2019)
03/19/2019	<u>25</u>	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 4/19/2019 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 1305, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer; and as further set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 3/19/2019) (anc) (Entered: 03/22/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>26</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE OF PRO BONO COUNSEL by David James Sandler on behalf of Open Society Justice Initiative Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Sandler, David) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>27</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 4/15/2019 re: Initial Conference. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/18/2019	<u>28</u>	CONSENT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 4/18/2019 re: requesting initial conference be moved to 1pm on 4/19/2019. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/18/2019	<u>29</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (28 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 17 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Letter, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court hereby adjourns this conference to noon on Friday, April 19, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Initial Conference set for 4/19/2019 at 12:00 PM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer.) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/18/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/22/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 4/22/2019. Amrit Singh & David Sandler present for Plaintiff. Natasha Teleanu & Peter Aronoff present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ajs) (Entered: 04/22/2019)

04/23/2019	<u>30</u>	SCEDULING ORDER: The above-captioned actions having been consolidated, see ECF No. 23 in 19 Civ. 234, absent further order of the Court, all filings in these matters going forward shall be made under the docket number 19 Civ. 234. The parties shall negotiate in good faith to narrow the scope of the search or exclude categories of non-substantive records identified by Defendants. On April 26, 2019, and every Friday thereafter until directed by the Court, the Parties shall update the Court in a joint letter on the status of discussions between the Parties and Defendants' responses to Plaintiffs Requests; and as further set forth herein. Status Conference set for 6/4/2019 at 03:30 PM in Courtroom 1305, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/22/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 04/23/2019)
04/24/2019	<u>31</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 4/19/2019 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Kelly Surina, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 5/15/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/28/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/23/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/24/2019	<u>32</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 4/19/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>33</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Central Intelligence Agency served on 1/16/2019, answer due 3/18/2019. Service was made by certified mail. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>34</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Service was made by certified mail and Also on the U. S. Attorney General. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>35</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. National Security Agency served on 1/16/2019, answer due 3/18/2019. Service was made by certified mail. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>36</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Office of the Director of National Intelligence served on 1/16/2019, answer due 3/18/2019. Service was made by certified mail. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>37</u>	STATUS REPORT. (<i>joint</i>) Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/29/2019	<u>38</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (23 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE, 37 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/29/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE (ks) (Entered: 04/29/2019)
05/03/2019	<u>39</u>	STATUS REPORT. (<i>joint</i>) and proposal for letter-briefing schedule regarding State's processing rate Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE,

		1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 05/03/2019)
05/06/2019	<u>40</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (25 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE, 39 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update and approves the parties' proposed letter briefing schedule. SO ORDERED. (Motions due by 5/13/2019. Responses due by 5/20/2019) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/6/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(ne) (Entered: 05/06/2019)
05/10/2019	<u>41</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 05/10/2019)
05/10/2019	<u>42</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (41 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 27 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/10/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 05/13/2019)
05/17/2019	<u>43</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 05/17/2019)
05/20/2019	<u>44</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from David J. Sandler dated May 20, 2019 re: opposition to the 5/13/19 DOS letter requesting the Court to approve States proposed processing rate of only 300 pages per month.. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Sandler, David) (Entered: 05/20/2019)
05/21/2019	<u>45</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from David J. Sandler dated 5/21/19 re: parties' consent to the over-length letter (Dkt. 44) and requesting the court to accept the over-length letter. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Sandler, David) (Entered: 05/21/2019)
05/22/2019	<u>46</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (45 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 33 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Letter, filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. The Court will accept the over-length letter on the consent of all parties. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/21/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(mro) (Entered: 05/22/2019)
05/22/2019	<u>47</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (31 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE, 43 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/22/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(mro) (Entered: 05/22/2019)
05/24/2019	<u>48</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 5/24/2019 re: weekly status update. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 05/24/2019)
05/29/2019	<u>49</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (36 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE, 48 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE) Letter, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State,

		Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. The Court adjourns State's May 29 and May 30 deadlines. The parties should confer and provide the Court new deadlines by June 4, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/29/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(rro) (Entered: 05/30/2019)
05/30/2019	<u>50</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (32 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE, 44 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE) Letter, filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. ENDORSEMENT: Having reviewed the parties' competing letters, the Court's judgment is that a processing rate of 5,000 pages per month, beginning June 2019, appropriately balances the urgency of this particular request with the State Department's concerns regarding the burdens of making FOTA productions. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/30/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 05/30/2019)
05/31/2019	<u>51</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 05/31/2019)
06/03/2019	<u>52</u>	ORDER: Due to a scheduling conflict, the Court reschedules the conference currently scheduled for June 4, 2019 at 3:30 p.m. to 4:30 p.m. that same day. SO ORDERED. (Status Conference set for 6/4/2019 at 04:30 PM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer.) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/3/2019) ***Pursuant to instructions from Chambers, Filed In All Member Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 06/03/2019)
06/03/2019	<u>53</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (51 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 39 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/3/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 06/03/2019)
06/04/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer: Status Conference held on 6/4/2019. Amrit Singh & David Sandler present for Plaintiff. Natasha Teleanu & Peter Aronoff present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ajs) (Entered: 06/05/2019)
06/05/2019	<u>54</u>	ORDER: At today's conference, the Court set the following deadlines: 1. The parties shall continue to provide the Court with joint weekly status updates, continuing June 7, 2019, and continuing every Friday thereafter; 2. The Department of Defense shall provide a proposed production schedule on June 17, 2019. It shall process 2,500 pages of responsive records by June 30, 2019, and thereafter process 5,000 pages per month; 3. The Department of Justice shall provide a proposed production schedule on June 5, 2019. It shall process responsive records at a rate of 5,000 pages per month; 4. The Department of State shall complete its search of classified and unclassified emails within 4.5 weeks; 5. The next status conference is scheduled for July 8, 2019 at 3:30 p.m. SO ORDERED. (Status Conference set for 7/8/2019 at 03:30 PM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer.) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/5/2019) (mml) (Entered: 06/05/2019)
06/07/2019	<u>55</u>	CONSENT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 6/7/2019 re: seeking limited clarification and/or modification of the Court's June 5, 2019 processing order as to DOD. Document filed by Department of Defense. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 06/07/2019)
06/07/2019	<u>56</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 06/07/2019)

06/10/2019	<u>57</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (55 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 43 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Letter, filed by Department of Defense. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. The Court appreciates the parties' collective efforts to create clearer proposed language. The Court adopts the language herein as superseding paragraphs 2 and 3 of its June 5, 2019 Order. Dkt. 54. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/10/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 06/10/2019)
06/10/2019	<u>58</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (56 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 44 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. The Court is cognizant of DOD's anticipated motion for reconsideration and authorizes the Government to attach a declaration in support. The Court reiterates, however, that unless and until the Court grants any motion for reconsideration, all Orders remain in effect. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/10/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 06/10/2019)
06/11/2019	<u>59</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 6/4/2019 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Steven Greenblum, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 7/2/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 7/12/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 9/9/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 06/11/2019)
06/11/2019	<u>60</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 6/4/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 06/11/2019)
06/13/2019	<u>61</u>	MOTION for Reconsideration <i>or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State.</i> Document filed by Department of Defense, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 06/13/2019)
06/13/2019	<u>62</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration <i>or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State.</i> . Document filed by Department of Defense, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 06/13/2019)
06/13/2019	<u>63</u>	DECLARATION of Mark H. Herrington in Support re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration <i>or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State..</i> Document filed by Department of Defense, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 06/13/2019)
06/13/2019	<u>64</u>	DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration <i>or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State..</i> Document filed by Department of Defense, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 06/13/2019)
06/14/2019	<u>65</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 06/14/2019)
06/17/2019	<u>66</u>	PROPOSED STIPULATION AND ORDER. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Sandler, David) (Entered: 06/17/2019)

06/17/2019	<u>67</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from David J. Sandler dated June 17, 2019 re: withdrawal as counsel for Plaintiff. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative.(Sandler, David) (Entered: 06/17/2019)
06/21/2019	<u>68</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 06/21/2019)
06/21/2019	<u>69</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (53 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Letter filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Attorney David James Sandler terminated.) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/21/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 06/24/2019)
06/21/2019	<u>70</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (54 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/21/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 06/24/2019)
06/21/2019	<u>71</u>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL OF DEFENDANT U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between Plaintiff and the FBI, and their respective counsel, that: Plaintiff releases and discharges the FBI from any and all claims and causes of action that Plaintiff asserted – or could have asserted – in this litigation arising out of the FOIA request. This action is hereby dismissed with prejudice with respect to the FBI, and without costs or attorneys' fees to any party; and as further set forth herein. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/21/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) Modified on 6/25/2019 (anc). (Entered: 06/24/2019)
06/27/2019	<u>72</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration <i>or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State.</i> / Plaintiff OSJI's Memorandum of Law in Opposition to the Government's Motion for Reconsideration. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 06/27/2019)
06/27/2019	<u>73</u>	DECLARATION of Catherine Amirfar in Opposition re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration <i>or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State..</i> Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Email from Amrit Singh to Natasha Teleanu, dated May 31, 2019, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Email from David Sandler to Natasha Teleanu, dated June 11, 2019, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – Email from Amrit Singh to Natasha Teleanu and Peter Aronoff, dated June 24, 2019, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 – Letter from Department of State to Amrit Singh, dated December 21, 2018)Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 06/27/2019)
06/28/2019	<u>74</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 06/28/2019)
07/01/2019	<u>75</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (74 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 60 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 7/1/2019) (ks) (Entered: 07/01/2019)
07/01/2019	<u>76</u>	MOTION for Matthew D. Forbes to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee of \$200.00 paid, receipt no. ANYSDC-17176407. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by

		Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Matthew D. Forbes in Support of Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice, # <u>2</u> Matthew D. Forbes Certificates of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Forbes, Matthew) Modified on 7/2/2019 (jc). (Entered: 07/01/2019)
07/02/2019		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. (76 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 62 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Matthew D. Forbes to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(jc) (Entered: 07/02/2019)
07/02/2019	<u>77</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE: granting <u>76</u> Motion for Matthew D. Forbes to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 7/02/2019) (ama) (Entered: 07/02/2019)
07/03/2019	<u>78</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 07/03/2019)
07/03/2019	<u>79</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State. . Document filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 07/03/2019)
07/03/2019	<u>80</u>	DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: (61 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 47 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) MOTION for Reconsideration or modification of Court's processing orders as to DOD and State.. Document filed by Department of State, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 07/03/2019)
07/08/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer: Status Conference held on 7/8/2019. Amrit Singh & Matthew Forbes present for Plaintiff. Natasha Teleanu & Peter Aronoff present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ajs) (Entered: 07/09/2019)
07/09/2019	<u>81</u>	ORDER: At today's conference, the Court set the following dates and deadlines: 1. The parties shall provide the Court with joint bi-weekly status updates, beginning July 18, 2019, and continuing every other Thursday thereafter; 2. The next status conference is scheduled for August 8, 2019 at 2:30 p.m. SO ORDERED., Status Conference set for 8/8/2019 at 02:30 PM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 7/8/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(rj) (Entered: 07/09/2019)
07/16/2019	<u>82</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 7/8/2019 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Rose Prater, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 8/6/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/16/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/15/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/16/2019)
07/16/2019	<u>83</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 7/8/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/16/2019)
07/18/2019	<u>84</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency,

		Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 07/18/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>85</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (84 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 68 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Status Report, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update and the parties' ongoing efforts to discuss technologies that would make FOIA productions more relevant and efficient. The Court does not require a supplement to this letter before the next scheduled bi-weekly update unless the parties believe they have reached an impasse on an issue that requires the Court's attention. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 7/19/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
08/01/2019	<u>86</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Matthew D. Forbes dated August 1, 2019. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Forbes, Matthew) (Entered: 08/01/2019)
08/01/2019	<u>87</u>	ORDER granting (86) Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:19-cv-00234-PAE; granting (70) Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:19-cv-01329-PAE: Granted. The status conference currently scheduled for August 8, 2019 is hereby adjourned to August 12, 2019 at 10:00. (Status Conference set for 8/12/2019 at 10:00 AM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer.) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 8/1/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE (jwh) (Entered: 08/01/2019)
08/01/2019	<u>88</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 08/01/2019)